

INTRODUCTION

In the twenty years before Johann Christian Bach wrote *Temistocle* (Warb G 8), Elector Palatine Carl Theodor had brought some of the most innovative Italian opera composers to Mannheim to write opere serie to celebrate his name day on 4 November.¹ His own Kapellmeister, Ignaz Holzbauer, also occasionally contributed to the exceptionally extravagant festivities, and among the works specifically written for Mannheim were operas by Niccolò Jommelli (*Cajo Fabrizio*, 1760), Tommaso Traetta (*Sofonisba*, 1762), Gian Francesco de Majo (*Ifigenia in Tauride*, 1764; and *Alessandro nell'Indie*, 1766), Niccolò Piccinni (*Catone in Utica*, 1770), and Holzbauer himself (*Adriano in Siria*, 1768). One commentator applauded the eclectic tastes of Carl Theodor:

*If Naples was distinguished by its splendor, Berlin by its critical precision, Dresden by its grace, Vienna by its tragic-comic, Mannheim gained the admiration of the world by its diversity. The elector's theater and his concert hall was virtually an Odeon, where the masterpieces of all artists were featured. The alternating whims of the elector contributed very much to this taste. Jommelli, Hasse, Graun, Traetta, Georg Benda, Sales, Agricola, the "London" Bach, Gluck, Schweitzer—alternated from year to year with the compositions of his own composers, so that there was no place in the world where one could cultivate one's musical taste so quickly and surely as in Mannheim.*²

1. This introduction, with slight modification, is based on Paul Corneilson, "Temistocle and Lucio Silla," in *The Operas of Johann Christian Bach: An Introduction*, ed. Jason B. Grant (Los Altos: The Packard Humanities Institute, 2023), 107–26. For further background, see Paul Edward Corneilson, "Opera at Mannheim, 1770–1778" (Ph.D. diss., University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, 1992); Nicole Baker, "Italian Opera at the Court of Mannheim 1758–1770" (Ph.D. diss., University of California, Los Angeles, 1994); Bärbel Pelker, "The Palatine Court in Mannheim," in *Music at German Courts, 1715–1760: Changing Artistic Priorities*, ed. Samatha Owens, Barbara M. Reul, and Janice B. Stockigt (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2011), 131–64; Eugene K. Wolf, "The Mannheim Court," in *The Classical Era*, ed. Neal Zaslaw (London: Macmillan, 1989), 213–39; and the foundational study by Friedrich Walter, *Geschichte des Theaters und der Musik am kurpfälzischen Hofe* (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1898).

2. "Wenn sich Neapel durch Pracht, Berlin durch kritische Genauigkeit, Dresden durch Grazie, Wien durch das Komischtragische auszeichneten; so erregte Manheim die Bewunderung der Welt durch Mannigfaltigkeit. Das Theater des Churfürsten und sein Concertsaal waren gleichsam ein

J.C. Bach was undoubtedly brought to the attention of the music-loving Carl Theodor by two of his prized musicians: the venerable tenor Anton Raaff, who joined the Hofkapelle in 1770, and the virtuoso flutist Johann Baptist Wendling, who was married to the prima donna, Dorothea Wendling. Raaff sang in Bach's *Catone in Utica* (Warb G 2) and *Alessandro nell'Indie* (Warb G 3) at Naples in 1761 and 1762, respectively, and Wendling was in London in the spring of 1772 to perform at the Bach-Abel concerts, which included the premiere of Bach's serenata *Endimione* (Warb G 15) on 6 April. Perhaps the two of them were able to convince Carl Theodor to commission an opera seria from Bach for November 1772.³

The operas at Mannheim were given in one of the largest opera houses of the eighteenth century, holding approximately 2000 people.⁴ Visiting dignitaries added to the pomp as described by the Saxon ambassador to the court, "The spectacles and other entertainments that have been scheduled to be given and especially the magnificent opera, *Temistocle*, with music by the famous Bach, chapel master of the Queen of England, have attracted to this court many visitors, who tomorrow will have the honor to pay their respects to the elector on his name day

Odeum, wo man die Meisterwerke aller Künstler charakterisirte. Die abwechselnde Laune des Fürsten trug sehr viel zu diesem Geschmacke bey. Jommelli, Hasse, Graun, Traetta, Georg Benda, Sales, Agricola, der Londoner Bach, Gluck, Schweizer—wechselten da Jahr aus Jahr ein mit den Compositionen seiner eignen Meister ab, so daß es keinen Ort in der Welt gab, wo man seinen musikalischen Geschmack in einer Schnelle so sicher bilden konnte, als Manheim." Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart, *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst*, ed. Ludwig Schubart (Vienna, 1806), 129–30. All translations are my own unless otherwise noted.

3. Wendling might have had an ulterior motive to bring Bach to Mannheim, and apparently Bach fell in love with Wendling's daughter Elisabeth Augusta. For more details see Paul Corneilson, "A Context for Mozart's French Ariettes: The Wendling Family and Friedrich Schiller's *Kabale und Liebe*," *Current Musicology* 81 (2006): 53–72.

4. See Paul Corneilson, "Reconstructing the Mannheim Court Theatre," *Early Music* (1997): 63–81. Unfortunately, most of the performing materials and any contracts for operas were likely lost when the court opera house was destroyed in November 1795, when the Austrian army attempted to drive the French occupying forces from the city. See Wolf, 41–43. Other copies of operas were lost during World War II; see Wolf, 199–200.

[4 November].” Two days later, the same diplomat reported, “Thursday [5 November] they performed the new opera, *Temistocle*, which won the general approbation for the excellence of the music as well as for the beauty and richness of the decorations. The ballets, entitled *Roger [dans l’isle Alcine]* and *Médée et Jason*, contributed very much to enhance the beauty of the spectacle, which was attended by a large number of visitors of all ranks.”⁵

Temistocle proved so successful that Bach was invited back to write a second opera, *Lucio Silla* (Warb G 9), two years later.⁶ Its premiere took place on 5 November 1775 and was well received, though the impending death of Carl Theodor’s nephew, Christian IV Duke of Zweibrücken, cast a shadow on its reception:

The spectacle presented, *Lucio Silla*, was of the most grand magnificence as much for the decorations as for the costumes of the actors and of the ballets, and the music composed by the celebrated Bach has been strongly applauded; but we saw how much his exalted highness the elector suffered from having to take part in this entertainment, expecting at any moment to receive the news of the death of the duke. When they returned to their apartments they were given the notices that had arrived during the spectacle, which brought news that the prince had died the same day at two o’clock in the morning. They announced a period of mourning for six weeks, and the academy which should have been given yesterday, and the opera [Anton Schweitzer’s] *Alceste* today, were cancelled.⁷

5. Count Andreas von Riaucour, report in D-Dla, Geheimes Kabinett, Loc. 2622–2628; quoted in Corneilson, “Opera at Mannheim,” 112–13, and appendix B, nos. 20–21. Ballets were generally given between the acts of operas, and these were mostly written by Christian Cannabich and Carl Joseph Toeschi. The surviving music, including Cannabich’s *Médée et Jason*, has been published in *Ballet Music from the Mannheim Court*, parts 1–5, ed. Floyd Grave et al. (Madison and Middleton, Wis.: A-R Editions, 1996–2018).

6. *Lucio Silla* was commissioned for November 1774, and Warburton, introduction to CWJCB, vol. 8, vii, gives the premiere as 4 November 1774, based on the printed libretto (OT 1). Terry, 130 (following Walter, *Geschichte*, 141), gives the date as 1776. The correct date and circumstances surrounding the first performance are discussed in Paul Corneilson, “The Case of J.C. Bach’s *Lucio Silla*,” *Journal of Musicology* 12 (1994): 206–18; reprinted in *J. C. Bach*, 473–85.

7. Riaucour, report in D-Dla, Geheimes Kabinett, Loc. 2627, Bd. XXVII: “Le spectacle représentant *Lucio Sylla*, étoit de la plus grande magnificence, tant pour les décorations que pour les habits des acteurs, et des Ballets, et la musique de la Composition du celebre Bach a été fort applaudie; mais on voyait, combien L. A. S. Eles. souffroient, d’être obligées de prendre part à ce divertissement, s’attendant à tout moment à recevoir la nouvelle de la mort du Duc. Lorsqu’elles furent rentrées dans leur appartement, on leur fit part des lettres qui étoient arrivées pendant le spectacle, lesquelles portoient, que ce Prince étoit décédé la même jour à 2. heures du matin. On annonça sur le champ un deuil de six semaines, et l’Académie qu’il devoit y avoir hier, et l’Opéra d’*Alceste*

The two ballets *Acis et Galatée* and *Achilles, reconnu par Ulysse, dans l’isle de Scyros* were written by Etienne Lauchery with music by Toeschi and Cannabich, respectively. Lorenzo Quaglio designed the scenery.

The “but” in Riaucour’s report seems to be particularly significant, and the untimely death of the Duke of Zweibrücken provides a possible explanation for the relative lack of success for the opera. Nevertheless, on 21 November 1775, Riaucour reported on a second performance of *Lucio Silla*; the German Singspiel *Alceste* was also performed in conjunction with the festivities for the name day of the electress. Although no further performances are mentioned by Riaucour, it is likely that *Lucio Silla* continued to be performed throughout Carnival 1776 and the following 20 November. It was the last Italian opera seria commissioned by the Mannheim court.⁸

Original Cast

The Mannheim court had a distinguished group of singers. It was a relatively stable company that tended to sing for several years, and some singers stayed for their entire careers. The original cast of *Lucio Silla* featured:

Anton Raaff (tenor)	Lucio Silla
Giovanni Battista Zonca (bass)	Lucio Cinna
Dorothea Wendling (soprano)	Giunia
Francesco Roncaglia (soprano castrato)	Cecilio
Elisabeth Wendling (soprano)	Celia
Pietro Paolo Carnoli (tenor)	Aufidio

First among the singers were Dorothea Wendling and her sister-in-law, Elisabeth Wendling, who shared the first and second female roles in the 1760s and 1770s, and who eventually created the roles of Ilia and Elettra in Mozart’s *Idomeneo* in Munich in 1781.⁹ Dorothea was an effective actress, and she excelled at cantabile singing. Her range extended from e♭’ to b♭’’; she only rarely sang c’’’ and never above this pitch. Over the course of her career, composers exploited the strength of her tessitura (b♭’ to f’’), and a

aujourd’hui, furent contremandés.” Translated in Corneilson, “The Case of J.C. Bach’s *Lucio Silla*,” 214.

8. At the end of 1777, Maximilian III Joseph, the Elector of Bavaria, died, and Carl Theodor moved his court to Munich in 1778. Two years later, he commissioned Mozart to write *Idomeneo* for many of the same singers and orchestral musicians.

9. See Paul Corneilson, “Mozart’s Ilia and Elettra: New Perspectives on *Idomeneo*,” in *Mozart’s “Idomeneo” und die Musik in München zur Zeit Karl Theodors*, ed. Theodor Göllner and Stephan Hörner (Munich: Bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2001), 97–113.

striking number of arias written specifically for her are in flat keys, especially B-flat, E-flat, and G minor. She could sing *passaggi*, although the brilliant style of *floriture* embellishment was not one of her strengths. Her specialty was the pathetic style and its attendant rhetorical gestures.¹⁰

After hearing Dorothea during rehearsals for Schweitzer's *Rosamunde*, which Mozart also attended, Christoph Martin Wieland wrote to Sophie La Roche on 24 December 1777:

The acquaintance with Madame Wendling, who will be my Rosamunde, and the hour in which she sang and acted her role for me for the first time, belongs among the most pleasant of my life. Her style of singing surpasses anything I have ever heard, even the famous Mara. This alone is true song—language of the soul and the heart, every note a living expression of the purest, most intimate feeling; the entire song a continuous line of beauty.—In short, I could talk for hours about this magnificent woman and never tire of it.¹¹

Elisabeth was ten years younger than Dorothea and was married to Franz Wendling, a violinist in the Mannheim orchestra and brother of Johann Baptist. Elisabeth often played the rival to Dorothea's roles. She had a somewhat wider range than Dorothea (d' to d''') and a higher tessitura. In general, Elisabeth's arias have more coloratura than Dorothea's, and composers usually wrote arias for her in sharp keys (G, D, A, and E major). Mozart heard her sing the role of Anna in Holzbauer's *Günther von Schwarzburg*, originally written for another soprano, Franziska Danzi, and remarked "consequently it is not suited to [Elisabeth Wendling's] voice but is too high for her."¹²

10. Mozart's concert aria K. 295a, written for her in Mannheim in February 1778, is a clear example of her vocal characteristics; see Paul Cornelson, "An Intimate Vocal Portrait of Dorothea Wendling: Mozart's Concert Aria K. 295a," *Mozart-Jahrbuch 2000*, 29–45.

11. "Die Bekanntschaft mit Madame Wendling, die meine Rosamund seyn wird, und die Stunde, worin sie mir ihre Rolle zum erstenmal sang und agierte, gehört unter das Angenehmste meines Lebens. Ihre Art zu singen übertrifft alles, was ich jemals, selbst von der berühmten Mara, gehört habe. Dies allein ist wahrer Gesang—Sprache der Seele und des Herzens, jeder Ton lebendiger Ausdruck des reinsten, innigsten Gefühls; der ganze Gesang eine fortwallende Schönheits-Linie.—Kurz, ich könnte Stundenlang von dem herrlichen Weibe schwatzen, und würd es nicht müde." *Wielands Briefwechsel*, vol. 5, *Briefe der Weimarer Zeit* (21. September 1772–31. December 1777), ed. Hans Werner Seiffert (Berlin: Akademie-Verlag, 1983), 693.

12. Letter dated 14 November 1777; *MBA*, 2:125. Danzi was in London at the time, and sang in Bach's *La clemenza di Scipione* in the spring of 1778.

The German tenor Raaff spent most of his career in Italy, where he was the leading tenor in the 1750s and 1760s. According to Schubart, Raaff was:

One of the foremost and best-grounded singers in Europe. His is one of the most beautiful tenor voices that can be heard. Its range spans from alto to bass. His tones are all thick, full, and pure. He sings everything set before him with inimitable polish, and varies an aria repeatedly with indescribable artistry. His embellishments and cadenzas, like his musical taste in general, are of unparalleled beauty; whatever he sings, he sings with deepest feeling and his lovely heart seems to reverberate in his song. Furthermore, perhaps only a few singers in the world know their art as thoroughly as Raaff. Unfortunately, this exceptional singer is growing old and has already begun to warble his tone.¹³

Mozart wrote the role of Idomeneo for Raaff in 1780, and while in Mannheim and Paris in 1777–78 he came to appreciate the elderly singer's special talent for *portato* singing, which Raaff learned while studying with Antonio Bernacchi in Bologna.¹⁴ Over the course of a dozen years Raaff sang the title roles in four of Bach's operas: *Catone*, *Alessandro*, *Temistocle*, and *Lucio Silla*. Each of these operas has four arias for Raaff (with a fifth in *Temistocle* that morphs into a finale). Most of the arias are *dal segno*, and many have a middle section in Allegretto $\frac{3}{8}$ —the type made popular by composers of Hasse's generation.¹⁵ They are predominantly in major keys (with one in C minor and one in G minor), and five of the seventeen arias are in B-flat or E-flat. Wind instruments are featured prominently in his arias, and in *Temistocle* there is an aria with obbligato

13. "Einer der ersten und gründlichsten Sängers in Europa. Seine Stimme ist der schönste Tenor, den man hören kann. Er steigt bis in die Sphäre des Alts hinauf, und eben so glücklich hinunter in die Regionen des Basses. Seine Töne sind alle dick, voll und rein. Er singt mit unnachahmlicher Fertigkeit alles vom Blatt weg, was man ihm vorlegt, und varirt eine Arie mehrmalen mit unbeschreiblicher Kunst. Seine Verzierungen und Cadenzen, wie überhaupt sein musikalischer Geschmack, sind unerreichbar schön; was er singt, singt er mit dem tiefsten Gefühl und sein schönes Herz scheint in seinem Gesange widerzuhallen. Ausserdem wissen vielleicht nur wenige Sängers der Welt so gründlich über ihre Kunst zu sprechen wie Raff. Schade, dass dieser seltn Mann jetzt altert, und schon anfängt mit seiner Stimme zu schattern." Schubart, *Ideen*, 136–37.

14. See Mozart's letters discussing Raaff on 14 November 1777, 28 February 1778, and 12 June 1778; see *MBA*, 2:125, 303–4, and 377–78, respectively. While working on *Idomeneo*, Mozart commented that "Raaff is like a statue"; letter of 8 November 1780; *MBA*, 3:13. See also Pierluigi Petrobelli, "The Italian Years of Anton Raaff," *Mozart-Jahrbuch 1973/74*, 233–73.

15. See Daniel Heartz, "Raaff's Last Aria: A Mozartean Idyll in the Spirit of Hasse," *MQ* 60 (1974): 517–43.

bassoon, and in *Lucio Silla* his last aria has obbligato oboe, bassoon, and horn.

After singing in Italy from 1757 to 1761, the bass-baritone Giovanni Battista Zonca went to London, where he sang mostly comic operas but also the role of Alessandro the season before Bach arrived.¹⁶ He came to Mannheim in 1764, and two years later he sang Alessandro again in de Majo's setting. Charles Burney heard Zonca in Mannheim and was not impressed.¹⁷ But this was in a comic opera, *La contadina in corte*, that was not written for him. Though he performed in many comic operas throughout his career, the music written for him in opere serie is more impressive, to the point that he rivals the principal tenors who sang with him. Lucio Cinna in *Lucio Silla* is a less prominent role than Serse that Zonca sang in *Temistocle*. Nevertheless, Mozart might have preferred to write the role of Idomeneo for Zonca.¹⁸

Francesco Roncaglia, who after making his debut in Italy in 1765 and spending four years in Munich (1768–71), where he was the *secondo uomo*, arrived at Mannheim in May 1771.¹⁹ He sang *secondo uomo* to Silvio Giorgetti in *Temistocle*, and he replaced Giorgetti as *primo uomo* in *Lucio Silla*. Bach must have liked his voice enough to bring him to London in 1777–78 as *primo uomo*. Burney heard Roncaglia in London in 1778:

Roncaglia had an elegant face and figure; a sweet-toned voice, a chaste and well-disciplined style of singing; hazarded nothing, and was always in tune. The best part of his voice, which was a soprano, was from D to A; he sometimes went to C, but not easily. Both his voice and shake were feeble; and of the three great requisites of a stage singer, pathos, grace, and execution, which the Italians call *cantabile*, *grazioso*, and *bravura*, he was in perfect possession only of the second.²⁰

16. Zonca's career is summarized in Saskia Willaert, "Italian Comic Opera in London, 1760–1770" (Ph.D. diss., King's College, University of London, 1999), 70–73.

17. Charles Burney, *The Present State of Music in Germany, The Netherlands, and United Provinces*, 2 vols. (London, 1773), 1:90: "an Italian tenor [*sic*], who was in England some years ago; his highest praise is, that he does not offend." In Sacchini's *La contadina in corte*, Zonca sang the role of Berto, with Silvio Giorgetti (Ruggiero), Franziska Danzi (Sandrina), and Magdalena Allegranti (Tancia).

18. Letter dated 27 December 1780; *MBA*, 3:72.

19. Raaff reported to Padre Martini on 5 May 1771 (I-Bc, I.4.102): "The Elector has taken to his service the soprano Roncaglia, who generally pleases our patron, a fact that must certainly be a great pleasure to his teacher Gibelli." (L'Elettore ha preso al suo servizio il Soprano Sig^e Roncaglia che piace al Padrone generalmente, cosa che deve far piacere al nostro Sig^e [castrato and composer Lorenzo] Gibelli suo Maestro.) Petrobelli, "Italian Years of Raaff," 261.

20. Charles Burney, *A General History of Music*, vol. 4 (London, 1789),

Rounding out the company was Pietro Paolo Carnoli. There is not too much to say about Carnoli, who was born in Parma but spent his entire career at Mannheim from 1752 to 1776, where he mostly sang the ultimate roles in opera seria and comic roles. Bach gave him only one aria in *Lucio Silla*, at the beginning of act 2.

Drama and Music

Giovanni de Gamerra's *Lucio Silla* was first set by Mozart and performed in Milan during carnival 1772.²¹ It is not clear how the libretto was selected to be set as an opera at Mannheim: possibly Bach chose it, but more likely it was chosen by the intendant or elector. The Mannheim text follows closely the construction and basic content of the original drama. Acts 1 and 3 remained basically intact, but Mattia Verazi performed major surgery on act 2.²² According to a note in the Mannheim libretto, it was "by order of His Serene Electoral Highness, adapted for the convenience of the composer, by means of several changes made in act 2 by Verazi" (per ordine di S.A.S.E. adattata al comodo del compositor della musica, medianti diversi cambiamenti fatti nell'atto secondo dal VERAZJ). The libretto was printed in 1774 for the elector's name day, but the premiere was delayed until November 1775 because Bach's score had been lost in transit.²³

The historical Lucius Cornelius Sulla was a ruthless tyrant and dictator. He was the subject of several operas in

508. Burney adds that Roncaglia had studied with Bernacchi, Raaff's teacher; but Raaff credits Gibelli as Roncaglia's "Maestro" (cf. n. 19).

21. For background on Mozart's opera, see Kathleen Kuzmick Hansell, "Opera and Ballet at the Regio Ducal Teatro of Milan 1771–76: A Musical and Social History" (Ph.D. diss., University of California, Berkeley, 1979). See also Laurine Quetin, *L'opera seria de Johann Christian Bach à Mozart* (Geneva: Minkoff, 2003); Mozart, "*Lucio Silla*": *Ein frühes Meisterwerk*, ed. Michael Fischer, Johannes Honsig-Erlenburg, and Ulrich Leisinger (Salzburg: Stiftung Mozarteum Salzburg, 2013); and the critical edition of de Gamerra's libretto, "*Lucio Silla*": *Lucio Cornelio Silla Dittatore*, ed. Lucio Tufano (Treviso: diastema editrice, 2013).

22. Verazi's changes are summarized in Corneilson, "Opera at Mannheim," 193–96. For a comparison of four settings of de Gamerra's libretto by Mozart, J.C. Bach, Anfossi (Venice, 1774), and Mortellari (Turin, 1779), see Christian Esch, "*Lucio Silla*": *Vier Opera-Seria-Vertonungen aus der Zeit zwischen 1770 und 1780* (Baden-Baden: Valentin Koerner, 1994), esp. 17–26. On Verazi, see Marita P. McClymonds, "Mattia Verazi and the Opera at Mannheim, Stuttgart, and Ludwigsburg," *Studies in Music from the University of Western Ontario* 7 (1982): 99–136; and McClymonds, "Transforming Opera Seria: Verazi's Innovations and their Impact on Opera in Italy," *Opera and the Enlightenment*, ed. Thomas Bauman and Marita Petzoldt McClymonds (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 119–32.

23. See Corneilson, "The Case of J.C. Bach's *Lucio Silla*."

the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, including a version by Handel (1713).²⁴ De Gamerra's version makes Lucio Silla a far more sympathetic character, who in the end forgives his enemies and allows his rival Cecilio to marry the woman he covets, Aspasia. Most of the aria texts remained unchanged and, with the exception of act 2, in the same order. De Gamerra's scena for Giunia, "Parto m'affretto" (act 2, scene 11), was among the numbers removed in Verazi's shuffling of act 2. Verazi replaced this piece with "Ah, se il crudel periglio," an aria that had been used in act 2, scene 4 in the original version. Because of its new location, Verazi had to write a different recitative text to precede the aria and a new second stanza for the aria itself. (See table 1 comparing the settings by Mozart and Bach.)

In *Lucio Silla*, Bach takes full advantage of the Mannheim orchestra, with pairs of flutes, oboes, clarinets, bassoons, horns, and strings in the overture; the middle movement features an oboe solo.²⁵ Only arias nos. 2, 10, and 11 are scored for strings alone; otherwise, Bach adds at least one pair of wind instruments to each number. Trumpets, plus oboes and horns, are used in Aufidio's aria no. 8 in act 2. Three clarinets d'amore accompany Silla's aria no. 9 in act 2, and his last aria no. 21 includes obbligato oboe, horn, and bassoon. An obbligato flute (likely played by J. B. Wendling) plus clarinets accompany Giunia's aria no. 14 in act 2. The final chorus "Il gran Silla a Roma in seno" is based on the chorus "Viva Ostorio, e viva Roma" in *Carattaco* (Warb G 7, no. 10). Bach transposed the chorus from C major to B-flat major, added two flutes and bassoons, and thoroughly revised the strings and winds, expanding the piece by more than forty measures.

Act 1 opens with Cecilio and his friend Cinna, who tells Cecilio that his beloved Giunia has been taken by Lucio Silla. In aria no. 1 (Allegro in F major), Cinna assures Cecilio that Giunia will be returned to him. Alone, Cecilio imagines his lover with him again in aria no. 2 (Andantino di molto in G major). Silla with his sister Celia and confidant Aufidio discuss Giunia's resistance to marry him, and Celia in aria no. 3 (Andante in D major) predicts that Giunia will bend to Silla's wishes. Aufidio warns Silla that Giunia is stubborn, and when Giunia is brought in by the guards, Silla asks her to make up her mind, but in aria

no. 4 (Largo assai—Allegro assai in E-flat major) Giunia refuses to give in. In an accompanied recitative followed by aria no. 5 (Allegro assai in C major), Silla promises revenge on Giunia. In a graveyard for Roman heroes, Cecilio is hiding behind the tomb of Caio Mario, Giunia's father, when Giunia enters accompanied by chorus no. 6 (in C minor) to pray at Mario's grave. Cecilio appears, but Giunia, thinking him dead, at first thinks that he is a ghost. In duet no. 7 (Larghetto con moto in B-flat major), the two lovers are reunited.

At the beginning of act 2, Aufidio tries to reassure Silla that Giunia will ultimately be his in aria no. 8 (Allegro maestoso in D major). Celia tells Silla that Giunia still refuses him, but in aria no. 9 (Larghetto con moto—Allegro in G major) Silla remains steadfast in hoping that Giunia will give in. Silla has told Celia that she can marry Cinna, who is a secret enemy of Silla, and Celia expresses her desire in aria no. 10 (Andante in A major). Cinna sees this as an opportunity to turn the tables on Silla in aria no. 11 (Allegro giusto non tanto presto in E major). Silla meets Giunia unexpectedly in the Hanging Gardens, and Giunia tells him that she would rather die than marry him. In aria no. 12 (Allegro in G minor) Silla says he no longer feels any compassion for her, but he continues to feel conflicted. Cecilio arrives and attempts to comfort Giunia in aria no. 13 (Largo ma non tanto—Allegretto in E-flat major), promising to be faithful to her until death. Alone in an accompanied recitative and aria no. 14 (Allegro in C major), Giunia fears for her beloved Cecilio. Chorus no. 15 (Allegro in F major) follows immediately, praising Silla as he enters the Campidoglio. Silla addresses the Senators and wants to force Giunia to marry him, but she refuses and tries to stab herself. Cecilio enters with his sword drawn, and Silla has him arrested. Then Cinna also enters with his sword but tells Silla that he was trying to protect Silla from Cecilio; Cinna is allowed to leave, and Giunia persuades Cecilio to lay down his sword. In trio no. 16 (Allegro in D major), Silla condemns Cecilio and Giunia, but they remain defiant.

In act 3, on the way to the prison, Cinna meets Cecilio and tells him that he plans to rescue both Cecilio and Giunia. Celia enters and agrees to appeal to Silla on their behalf, and if successful, Cinna will marry her; in aria no. 17 (Allegro moderato in G major) she hopes for the best. Cecilio and Cinna think it unlikely that Celia will persuade Silla, but in aria no. 18 (Allegro moderato in D major) Cinna predicts that Silla will fall. Giunia comes to Cecilio to bid farewell and to die with him. Aufidio orders Cecilio to go to Silla, and Cecilio tells Giunia not to cry for

24. See Laurine Quetin, "Lucio Silla, un livret à la hauteur de la partition?" *Mozart-Jahrbuch* 1991, 594–600. See also Robert C. Ketterer, "Senecanism and the 'Sulla' Operas of Handel and Mozart," *Syllecta Classica* 10 (1999): 215–34.

25. For an overview of the Mannheim orchestra, see Eugene K. Wolf, "On the Composition of the Mannheim Orchestra, ca. 1740–1778," *Basler Jahrbuch für historische Musikpraxis* 17 (1993): 113–38.

TABLE I. COMPARISON OF LUCIO SILLA SETTINGS BY MOZART AND J. C. BACH

Mozart's <i>Lucio Silla</i> Number (Character)	Incipit	Key	J. C. Bach's <i>Lucio Silla</i> Number (Character)	Incipit	Key
Act 1					
1. Aria (Cinna)	"Vieni ov' amor t'invita"	B \flat major	1. Aria (Cinna)	"Vieni ove amor t'invita"	F major
2. Aria (Cecilio)	"Il tenero momento"	F major	2. Aria (Cecilio)	"Il tenero momento"	G major
3. Aria (Celia)	"Se lusinghiera speme"	C major	3. Aria (Celia)	"Se lusinghiera speme"	D major
4. Aria (Giunia)	"Dalla sponda tenebrosa"	E \flat major	4. Aria (Giunia)	"Dalla sponda tenebrosa"	E \flat major
5. Aria (Silla)	"Il desio di vendetta e di morte"	D major	5. Aria (Silla)	"Nell'odio costante"	C major
6. Coro (SATB + Giunia)	"Fuor di queste urne dolenti"	E \flat major / G minor	6. Coro (SATB + Giunia)	"Fuor di quest'urne dolenti"	C minor
7. Duetto (Giunia, Cecilio)	"D'Eliso in sen m'attendi"	A major	7. Duetto (Giunia, Cecilio)	"D'Eliso in sen m'attendi"	B \flat major
Act 2					
8. Aria (Aufidio)	"Guerrier, che d'un acciaio"	C major	8. Aria (Aufidio)	"Guerrier, che d'un acciaio"	D major
9. Aria (Cecilio)	"Quest'improvviso tremito"	D major	9. Aria (Silla)	"Anch'io per un'ingrata"	G major
10. Aria (Celia)	"Se il labbro timido"	G major	10. Aria (Celia)	"Il labbro timido"	A major
11. Aria (Giunia)	"Ah, se il crudel periglio"	B \flat major	11. Aria (Cinna)	"Nel fortunato istante"	E major
12. Aria (Cinna)	"Nel fortunato istante"	F major	12. Aria (Silla)	"D'ogni piet� mi spoglio"	B \flat major
13. Aria (Silla)	"D'ogni piet� mi spoglio"	C major	13. Aria (Cecilio)	"Ah, se a morir mi chiama"	E \flat major
14. Aria (Cecilio)	"Ah, se a morir mi chiama"	E \flat major	14. Aria (Giunia)	"Ah, se il crudel periglio"	C major
15. Aria (Celia)	"Quando sgl'arsi campi"	A major	15. Coro (SATB)	"Se gloria il crin ti cinse"	F major
16. Aria (Giunia)	"Parto, m'affretto"	C major	16. Terzetto (Silla, Cecilio, Giunia)	"Quell'orgoglioso sdegno"	D major
17. Coro (SATB)	"Se gloria il crin ti cinse"	F major			
18. Terzetto (Silla, Cecilio, Giunia)	"Quell'orgoglioso sdegno"	B \flat major			
Act 3					
19. Aria (Celia)	"Strider sento la procella"	B \flat major	17. Aria (Celia)	"Strider sento la procella"	G major
20. Aria (Cinna)	"De' pi� superbi il core"	D major	18. Aria (Cinna)	"De' pi� superbi il core"	D major
21. Aria (Cecilio)	"Pupille amate"	A major	19. Aria (Cecilio)	"Pupille amate"	A major
22. Aria (Giunia)	"Fra i pensier pi� funesti di morte"	C minor	20. Aria (Giunia)	"Fra i pensier pi� funesti di morte"	F minor
23. Coro (SATB)	"Il gran Silla a Roma in seno"	D major	21. Aria (Silla)	"Se al generoso ardire"	E \flat major
			22. Coro (SATB)	"Il gran Silla a Roma in seno"	B \flat major

him in aria no. 19 (Andantino in A major). After Cecilio is led away, Giunia has an anguished soliloquy in an accompanied recitative and aria no. 20 (Allegro di molto in F minor), lamenting her lover's death and anticipating her own. In the Temple of Vesta, Cinna and Celia plead with Silla to spare Cecilio and not force Giunia to marry him. In aria no. 21 (Andantino—Allegro in E-flat major), Silla decides to make a noble gesture. Giunia confronts him, and Silla tells her to calm down. In the final scene Silla addresses the people of Rome and spares the life of Cecilio and gives him Giunia to be his bride. Cinna also confesses his hatred, but Silla forgives him and allows him to marry Celia. Finally, Silla removes his laurel crown and abdicates as dictator, and all rejoice and praise him in the closing chorus no. 22 (Allegro maestoso in B-flat major).

Bach would not have known Mozart's 1772 setting for Milan, and Mozart only became acquainted with Bach's setting in Mannheim in 1777. The most significant difference between Mozart's and Bach's settings of *Lucio Silla* is the expanded role of Silla in Bach's version. Mozart's original interpreter was Bassano Morgnani, an inexperienced tenor who arrived in Milan only one week before the premiere on 26 December 1772. He had only appeared on the stage before in Lodi in 1763–65, and Mozart scrambled to complete his music.²⁶ Raaff deserved an expanded role, and in the revised version he has four arias instead of Morgnani's two. In act 1, Verazi replaced de Gamerra's "Il desio di vendetta e di morte" with a new aria for Silla, "Nell'odio costante." In act 2, Silla's "D'ogni pietà mi spoglio" was retained by Verazi, but he added a new aria for Silla, "Anch'io per un'ingrata," near the beginning of act 2. Although Silla's aria in act 3, "Se al generoso ardire," was printed in the Milan libretto, it had to be cut (or, more likely, Mozart never set the text).

Many of the differences can be accounted for in the particular tastes and abilities of the singers or composers. As usual, arias were "fitted to each singer," emphasizing their skills and tastes.²⁷ Mozart's Cecilio was sung by the castrato Venanzio Rauzzini, who had four arias plus a duet and trio. Bach's Cecilio was Roncaglia, who had one fewer aria. Cecilio's aria in act 3, "Pupille amate," occurs in the same location in the respective settings by Mozart and Bach. Both pieces are in A major and in a moderate

$\frac{3}{8}$ tempo, but the qualities of the two vocal lines are strikingly different.²⁸ Mozart, who borrowed a copy of Bach's score from Georg Joseph Vogler in 1777, reported that Vogler thought Bach's aria "hideous" (abscheuliche aria) and "morose" (die Sauerey).²⁹ Bach's setting, with its dotted rhythm, does seem overly fussy and mannered. Mozart's, on the other hand, is simple, natural, and noble.

Similarly, Mozart's Giunia (Anna Lucia de Amicis) was a much more brilliant singer than Bach's Giunia (Dorothea Wendling).³⁰ Like Cecilio, Mozart's Giunia has one more aria than Bach's Giunia, with Verazi moving "Ah, se il crudel periglio" from earlier in act 2 and using it to replace "Parto m'affretto" later in the same act. Mozart wrote a bravura aria for de Amicis, and he later had Aloisia Weber sing it at a concert in Mannheim in 1778.³¹ Bach's aria for Dorothea Wendling, by contrast, is an Andante in C major, with most of the passage work given to the solo flute, which would have been played by Johann Baptist.

Only one complete copy of *Lucio Silla* survives (in D-DS, Mus. Ms. 60; facsimile in CWJCB, vol. 8), formerly in the possession of Vogler. The autograph score is lost, and only a handful of individual arias are extant.³² This confirms Mozart's statement in his letter that *Temistocle* was more successful than *Lucio Silla*. Normally, *Lucio Silla* would also have been performed during carnival 1776; otherwise, there is only one other documented performance on 20 November 1776.

The opera was revived in 1929 at the Stadttheater in Kiel in a German translation by Fritz Tutenberg. *Lucio Silla* was performed at the Schwetzingen Festival in 1974, at the Vienna Festival in 1985, and more recently at the Mozartwoche in 2013, conducted by Ivor Bolton.

Paul Corneilson

26. See Leopold's letters of 5 and 12 December 1772; *MBA*, 1:465–66.

27. For a comparison between Mozart's and Bach's settings of Cinna's entrance aria, "Vieni o' amor t'invita," see Martha Feldman, "Mozart and His Elders: Opera-seria Arias, 1766–1775," *Mozart-Jahrbuch* 1991, 564–75; reprinted in *J. C. Bach*, 423–34.

28. See Ernest Warburton, "Lucio Silla—by Mozart and J. C. Bach," *Musical Times* 126 (1985): 726–30.

29. Letter dated 13 November 1777; *MBA*, 2:120. But it is also clear that Mozart had little respect for Vogler's music.

30. On de Amicis, see Ulrich Leisinger, "Anna Lucia De Amicis Buonsollazzi: Mozart's erste Giunia," in *Mozart, "Lucio Silla": Ein frühes Meisterwerk*, 147–70.

31. Martha Feldman discusses this aria in "Staging the Virtuoso: Ritornello Procedure in Mozart, from Aria to Concerto," in *Mozart's Piano Concertos: Text, Context, Interpretation*, ed. Neal Zaslaw (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1996), 149–86, esp. 153–76.

32. The individual pieces and brief descriptions are given in Warb, 306 and in CWJCB, vol. 48, pt. 2. The overture was published in *Six Grand Overtures*, op. 18 (London, 1781).